

**Prosecution Premises:**

(Some, ironically, elicited from Dr. White, a defense witness)

**Symbolized:**

1. The pulse monitor was inadequate to properly monitor Jackson when Dr. Murray left the room. **I**

2. Dr. Murray had given Jackson propofol as a sleep aid and left the room. **S . L**

3. White said he would not have left the room, if Jackson had told him he “liked propofol.” **T ⊃ ~ R**

4. Dr. Murray should never have given Jackson propofol at home, alone in his bedroom (it should be given only in a hospital setting). **~ B . H**

5. White would get \$11,000 to testify. **W**

**[Fallacy: Red Herring]**

6. Dr. Shafer (prosecution witness) said that Dr. White’s theory of self-administration of the propofol was “crazy” and giving it in a home setting was a “pharmacological never-never land.” **C . N**

**[Fallacy: Ad hominem abusive]**

7. Dr. Shafer said that Dr. Murray committed “17 violations of the standard of care” and furthermore he should never have given Jackson propofol as a sleep aid. **V . ~ P**

8. Michael Jackson's three children are left without a father.  $\sim F$

[Fallacy: Appeal to pity]

Symbolized, the prosecution's argument looks this way:

$I . S . L . T \supset \sim R . \sim B . H . W . C . N . (V . \sim P) \supset G .$

Prosecutor's Premises 2 and 4:  $(S . L) . (\sim B . H)$  seem adequate to prove Dr. Murray's guilt.

**Defense Premises:**

1. White told jurors that he believes that the evidence shows that Jackson must have self-administered the propofol. Dr. Murray had stated that he gave Jackson only 25 milligrams of propofol, not enough by itself to kill him. [But if this is true, Murray is not guilty of killing Jackson.]

$E \supset M$

$M \supset \sim G / \therefore \sim G$

2. When you add up all the prosecution premises, do they yield that Murray killed Jackson? In Premise #2, if Dr. Murray gave propofol to Michael Jackson in Jackson's home (and not in a hospital setting) and left the room, then he is guilty of involuntary manslaughter.

$D \supset G$

**The defense arguments are:  $E \supset M$**

**Sources: Coverage of the Trial on Headline News and CNN**

[www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/10/29/michael-jackson-death-trial](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/10/29/michael-jackson-death-trial)

[www.aol.com/2011/10/31/conrad-murray-trial](http://www.aol.com/2011/10/31/conrad-murray-trial)